Dated: 31, December, 2022

Media Coverage

Press Release

"SUPREME COURT DECIDES FIRST EVERCARTEL CASE; UPHOLDS FINDING OF CARTELIZATION IN POULTRY SECTOR"

DAWN

31, December, 2022 | Business Page 09 | CCP Press Release



INQUIRY has found that hatcheries/poultry companies collectively discussed and fixed prices of day-old broiler chicks, which is against the Competition Act.—White Star/file

SC orders poultry association to pay Rs25m fine in cartel case

Verdict comes six years after CCP imposed Rs100m fine on PPA

By Kalbe Ali

ISLAMABAD: While petitions against penalties of over Rs74 billion imposed by the Competition Commission of Pakistan (CCP) are still pending, the Supreme Court has decided the first-ever cartel case against the poultry association.

In its verdict, the apex court upheld the CCP order of Feb 29, 2016 against the Pakistan Poultry Association (PPA) related to price fixing.

The case relates to an order passed by the CCP in 2010, and after moving through various legal forums, the PPA filed an appeal against the decision in the Competition Appellate Tribunal, but lost the case there and later filed an appeal against the decision in the apex court.

The CCP had imposed a fine of Rs100 million on PPA for price fixing of poultry products, which was a violation of Section 4 of the Competition Act 2010, which relates to cartelisation and collective price setting, etc.

The three-member bench comprising Justice Ijaz ul Ahsan, Justice Munib Akhtar and Justice Sayyed Mazahar Ali Akbar Naqvi reduced the penalty from Rs100m to Rs25m and ordered the PPA to pay the amount within 15 days.

At the same time, the apex court also directed the CCP to "frame and notify relevant rules inter alia relating to imposition of penalties." Currently, there exist guidelines on the imposition of financial penalties.

Under Section 57 of the Competition Act, the commission, with the approval of the federal government, has the power to make rules.

The CCP order was issued after a thorough inquiry that found that PPA had inter alia discussed and approved the advertisement of prices of certain poultry products concerning broiler chicken and chicken eggs in the national press, which was prohibited under the Competition Act.

In its order against the PPA, the Competition Tribunal held that by advertising prices of the poultry products in the national press the appellant has prevented, restricted and reduced competition within the relevant market, which is a clear violation of section 4 of the act. The PPA had filed an appeal against the order before the top court.

The CCP has time and again highlighted collusive/anti-competitive practices in the poultry sector. The first case against the poultry sector was taken up in 2010 when the CCP issued show-cause notices against 25 PPA members and imposed a Rs50m fine for price fixing.

The News International

31, December, 2022 | Front Page | CCP Press Release

First-ever cartel case

SC upholds CCP's findings against poultry association

Reduces penalty imposed on PPA from Rs100m to Rs25m

By our correspondent

ISLAMABAD: The Supreme bunal that upheld the CCP's Court of Pakistan upheld the February 29, 2016 judgment findings of Competition Com- with respect to price fixing mission of Pakistan (CCP) in contravention of Section 4 against the Pakistan Poultry of the Competition Act, 2010. Association (PPA) in the firstto Rs25.

on behalf of the Pakistan Poultry Association (PPA) against the judgment of the Competition Appellate Tri-

The CCP had imposed ever cartel case. However, a fine of Rs100 million on the apex court reduced the the Pakistan Poultry Assopenalty amount imposed on ciation (PPA) for the fixing the PPA from Rs100 million of price of poultry products in violation of Section 4 of In a statement issued the Competition Act, 2010. on Friday, the CCP said The Supreme Court, to this that while deciding the extent, allowed the PPA's first-ever cartel case, the appeal and reduced the Supreme Court of Pakistan penalty from Rs100 million. decided the civil appeal filed imposed by the CCP in its

Continued on page 4

Remaining

SC upholds CCP's findings

poultry."

The court directed the imposition of penalties." Cur- Section 4 of the Act." rently, there exist guidelines power to make rules.

try Association had inter Court. alia discussed and approved

Continued from page 1 national press, which was notices against 25 poultry prohibited under the Compe- association members and order, to Rs25 million, while tition Act. Against the CCP's imposed a fine of Rs50 million taking into account that the order, the first appeal was on the PPA for contravention said advertisements by the filed by the PPA before the of Section 4 of the Competi-PPA were discontinued after Competition Tribunal and its tion Act. In 2021, the show a few days, such as "after two decision was authored by the cause proceedings against days for eggs and five days for Member, Technical, Ahmed the said poultry association Owais Pirzada.

PPA to pay the penalty held: "By advertising prices High Court had set aside the amount of Rs25 million of the poultry products in the stay order(s) granted after a within a period of 15 days national press, the appellant period of over 10 years. from the date of the order. has clearly restricted and Moreover, it directed the CCP reduced the competition two inquiries in 2021 concernto "frame and notify relevant within the relevant market, ing possible collusive and rules inter alia relating to the which is a clear violation of anti-competitive practices in

on the imposition of financial that the findings recorded the market for broiler meat, penalties. Under Section 57 by the CCP were "based on eggs, day-old broiler chicks of the Act, the Commission, proper appraisal of the rel- and various poultry feed segwith the approval of the fed- evant provisions of Compe- ments. eral government, has the tition Law as well as other material brought on record. revealed that inter alia the The Supreme Court pro- The same are, therefore, poultry feed mills collectively ceedings pertained to the maintained." The PPA had fixed the price of poultry feed CCP's order, wherein the filed an appeal against the and, in the other inquiry, it competition commission said Competition Tribunal was concluded that inter alia found that the Pakistan Poul- order before the Supreme the hatcheries/poultry com-

and chicken eggs) in the the CCP issued show cause Act.

members also resumed after The Competition Tribunal the Honourable Islamabad

The CCP also concluded various market categories in It was further observed the poultry sector, including

The first inquiry report panies collectively discussed The CCP has time and and decided on prices of daythe advertisement of prices again highlighted collusive/ old broiler chicks, which are of certain poultry products anti-competitive practices in in prima facie violation of (concerning broiler chicken the poultry sector. In 2010, Section 4 of the Competition

Business Recorder

31, December, 2022 | Page 03 | CCP Press Release

First-ever cartel case: SC allows PPA's appeal, reduces penalty to Rs25m

RECORER REPORT

Tribunal that upheld the to make rules. Order of CCP with respect to Competition Act, 2010.

PKR 100 million imposed by CCP in its Order to PKR 25 that the said advertisements Pirzada. by PPA were discontinued two days for eggs and five days for poultry". The Supreme Court has directed PPA to pay the penalty amount of PKR 25 million from the date of the Order.

of the Competition Appellate Government, has the power Supreme Court.

price fixing in contravention ceedings pertained to CCP's competitive practices in the of Section 4 of the Order wherein CCP found poultry sector. that PPA had inter alia dis-CCP had imposed a fine of cussed and approved the issued show cause notices Rs100 million on the advertisement of prices of against 25 poultry association Pakistan Poultry Association certain poultry products (con-members and imposed a fine (PPA) for price fixing of cerning broiler chicken and of PKR 50 million on PPA poultry products, in violation chicken eggs) in the national for contravention of Section 4 of Section 4 of the press, which was prohibited of the Competition Act. In Competition Act, 2010. The under the Competition Act. 2021, the show cause pro-Supreme Court, to this extent, Against CCP's Order, the ceedings against the said has allowed PPA's appeal first appeal was filed by PPA poultry association members and reduced the penalty from before the Competition also resumed after the Tribunal and its decision was Islamabad High Court had set authored by the Member, aside the stay order(s) granted million, taking into account Technical, Ahmed Owais after a period of over 10

The Competition Tribunal

CCP has time and again the Competition Act. The Supreme Court pro- highlighted collusive/anti-

First in 2010 where CCP

CCP also concluded two after a few days, i.e., "after held that: "... By advertising enquiries in 2021 concerning prices of the poultry products possible collusive and antiin the national press the competitive practices in variappellant has clearly prevent- ous market categories in the ed, restricted and reduced poultry sector including the competition within the rele- market for broiler meat, eggs, within a period of 15 days vant market, which is a clear day old broiler chicks and violation of section 4 of the various poultry feed seg-Moreover, the Supreme Act." It was further observed ments. The first enquiry Court has directed CCP to that the findings recorded by report revealed that inter alia "frame and notify relevant CCP were "based on proper the poultry feed mills collec-

rules inter alia relating to appraisal of relevant provitively fixed the price of poul-ISLAMABAD: While imposition of penalties." sions of Competition Law as try feed and, in the other deciding the first-ever cartel Currently, there exists guide- well as other material brought enquiry, it was concluded case, the Supreme Court of lines on imposition of finan- on record. The same are, that inter alia the hatch-Pakistan has decided the civil cial penalties. Under Section therefore, maintained." PPA eries/poultry companies colappeal filed on behalf of 57 of the Act, the had filed an appeal against lectively discussed and decid-Pakistan Poultry Association Commission, with the the said Competition ed on prices of day-old broil-(PPA) against the judgement approval of the Federal Tribunal order before the er chicks, which are in prima facie violation of Section 4 of

Express Tribune

31, December, 2022 | Back Page | CCP Press Release

Supreme Court gives ruling in first-ever cartel case

Reduces penalty of Rs100m imposed on PPA to Rs25m

OUR CORRESPONDENT

ISLAMABAD

Supreme The lowed Pakistan Poultry order of CCP on February 29, PPA before the Competition Association's (PPA) ap- 2016 for price fixing. peal and reduced the Moreover, the SC has dipenalty of Rs100 million rected CCP to "frame and poultry products in the naimposed by the Competition notify relevant rules intertional press, the appellant Commission of Pakistan alia relating to imposition has prevented, restricted (CCP) to Rs25 million.

While deciding the firstever cartel case, it was taken guidelines on the imposi- which is a clear violation of into account that PPA's adtion of financial penalties. Section 4 of the Act," said the vertisements were discon- Under Section 57 of the Competition Tribunal. tinued after a few days, ie. Act, the commission, with "after two days for eggs and the approval of the federal findings recorded by CCP five days for poultry".

The SC has directed PPA to make rules. pay the penalty of Rs25 million within 15 days from the tained to the CCP's order law as well as other material date of the order.

of Rs100 million on PPA for cussed and approved an price fixing of poultry prod- advertisement of prices of ucts, in violation of Section 4 certain poultry products of the Competition Act 2010. (concerning broiler chicken

was filed on behalf of PPA press, which was prohibited against the judgement of under the Competition Act. Court the Competition Appellate (SC) of Pakistan has al- Tribunal that upheld the first appeal was filed by

of penalties".

government, has powers to were "based on proper ap-

wherein the commission brought on record. The same

Earlier, a civil appeal and chicken eggs) in the

Against the CCP's order. Tribunal.

"By advertising prices of and reduced competition Currently, there exist within the relevant market.

It was observed that the praisal of relevant provi-The SC's proceedings per- sions of the competition CCP had imposed a fine found that PPA had dis- is, therefore, maintained."

Pakistan Observer

31, December, 2022 | Page 06 | CCP Press Release

SC upholds CCP's findings on cartelization in poultry sector

ISLAMABAD

The Competition Commission of Pakistan (CCP) on Friday said it had time and again highlighted collusive/anti-competitive practices in the poultry sector and its findings in that regard had been upheld by the Supreme Court (SC).

The CCP, in a press release, said it was the first ever cartel case decided by the apex court, disallowing the civil appeal of Pakistan Poultry Association (PPA) against the judgement of the Competition Appellate Tribunal that upheld the CCP's order of February 29, 2016 with



respect to price fixing in contravention of Section 4 of the Competition Act, 2010.

The SCP to some extent allowed the PPA's appeal, by reducing the penalty from Rs 100 million imposed by CCP in its order to Rs 25 million, taking into account that the said advertisements by the PPA were discontinued after a few days, i.e., "after two days for eggs and five days for poultry", it added.

The apex court directed the PPA to pay the Rs 25 million penalty within of 15 days from the date of the order.

The Supreme Court also directed the CCP to "frame and notify relevant rules inter alia relating to imposition of penalties".

"Currently, there exists guidelines on imposition of

financial penalties.

Under Section 57 of the Act, the Commission, with the approval of the Federal Government, has the power to make rules," the CCP said.

The SC proceedings pertained to the CCP's order wherein the Commission found that the PPA had inter alia discussed and approved the advertisement of prices of certain poultry products (concerning broiler chicken and chicken eggs) in the national press, which was prohibited under the Competition Act..—APP

The Nation

31, December, 2022 | Page 03 | CCP Press Release

SC reduces penalty imposed on PPA by Competition Appellate Tribunal

Apex court decides civil appeal filed on behalf of PPA against Tribunal's judgement

IMRAN ALI KUNDI ISLAMABAD

While deciding the first-ever cartel case, the Supreme Court of Pakistan has decided the civil appeal filed on behalf of Pakistan Poultry Association (PPA) against the judgement of the Competition Appellate Tribunal, that upheld the Order of CCP dated 29 February 2016 with respect to price fixing in contravention of Section 4 of the Competition Act, 2010.

CCP had imposed a fine of Rs100 million on the Pakistan Poultry Association (PPA) for price fixing of poultry products, in violation of Section 4 of the Competition Act, 2010. The Supreme Court, to this extent, has allowed PPA's appeal and reduced the penalty from Rs100 million imposed by CCP in its order to Rs25 million, taking into account that the said advertisements by PPA were discontinued after a few days, ie, "after two days for eggs and five days for poultry." The Supreme Court directed PPA to pay the penalty amount of Rs25 million within a period of 15 days from the date of the order.

Moreover, the Supreme Court directed CCP to "frame and notify relevant rules inter alia relating to imposition of penalties." Currently, there exist guidelines on imposition of financial penalties. Under Section 57 of the Act, the Commission, with the approval of the federal government, has the power to make rules.

The SC proceedings pertained to CCP's Order wherein CCP found that PPA had inter alia discussed and approved the advertisement of prices of certain poultry products (concerning broiler chicken and chicken eggs) in the national press, which was prohibited under the Competition Act. Against CCP's Order, the first appeal was filed

by PPA before the Competition Tribunal and its decision was authored by the Member, Technical, Ahmed Owais Pirzada. The Competition Tribunal held that: "...By advertising prices of the poultry products in the national press the appellant has clearly prevented, restricted and reduced competition within the relevant market, which is a clear violation of section 4 of the Act." It was further observed that the findings recorded by CCP were "based on proper appraisal of relevant provisions of Competition Law as well as other material brought on record. The same are, therefore, maintained." PPA had filed an appeal against the said Competition Tribunal order before the Supreme Court.

CCP has time and again highlighted collusive/anti-competitive practices in the poultry sector. First in 2010 CCP issued showcause notices against 25 poultry association members and imposed a fine of Rs50 million on PPA for contravention of Section 4 of the Competition Act. In 2021, the showcause proceedings against the said poultry association members also resumed after the Honourable Islamabad High Court had set aside the stay order(s) granted after a period of over 10 years.

CCP also concluded two enquiries in 2021 concerning possible collusive and anti-competitive practices in various market categories in the poultry sector including the market for broiler meat, eggs, day old broiler chicks and various poultry feed segments. The first enquiry report revealed that inter alia the poultry feed mills collectively fixed the price of poultry feed and, in the other enquiry, it was concluded that inter alia the hatcheries/poultry companies collectively discussed and decided on prices of day-old broiler chicks, which are in prima facie violation of Section 4 of the Competition Act.

Pakistan Today

31, December, 2022 | Page 03 | CCP Press Release

PENALTY REDUCED TO RS25M: SC UPHOLDS CCP 'CARTELIZATION VERDICT' AGAI

STAFF REPORT

HE Supreme Court of Pakistan on Friday decided the civil appeal filed by Pakistan Poultry Association (PPA) against the judgment of Competition Commission Appellate Tribunal, that upheld the Order of CCP dated 29 February 2016 with respect to price fixing in contravention of Section 4 of the Competition Act, 2010.

The Competition Commission of Pakistan (CCP) had imposed a fine of Rs100 million on the Pakistan Poultry Association (PPA) for price fixing of poultry products, in violation of Section 4 of the Competition Act, 2010.

from Rs100 million imposed by CCP to Rs25 million, taking into account that the said advertisements by PPA were discontinued after a few days, i.e., "after two days for eggs and five days for poultry". The SC directed PPA to pay the penalty amount of Rs25 million within a period of 15 days from the date of the Order.

Moreover, the Supreme Court directed the CCP to "frame and notify relevant rules inter alia relating to imposition of penalties." Currently there exist guidelines on imposition of financial penalties. Under Section 57 of the Act, the Commission, with the approval of the Federal Government, has the power to make rules.

The Supreme Court proceedings pertained to CCP's Order wherein CCP found that PPA had inter alia

The Supreme Court, however, reduced the penalty discussed and approved the advertisement of prices of certain poultry products (concerning broiler chicken and chicken eggs) in the national press, which was prohibited under the Competition Act.

Against CCP's Order, the first appeal was filed by PPA before the Competition Tribunal and its decision was authored by the Member, Technical, Mr. Ahmed Owais Pirzada. The Competition Tribunal held that: "... By advertising prices of the poultry products in the national press the appellant has clearly prevented, restricted and reduced competition within the relevant market, which is a clear violation of section 4 of the Act." It was further observed that the findings recorded by CCP were "based on proper appraisal of relevant

brought on record. The same are, therefore, maintained." PPA had filed an appeal against the said Competition Tribunal order before the Supreme Court.

The CCP has time and again highlighted collusive/anti-competitive practices in the poultry sector. First in 2010 where the CCP issued show cause notices against 25 poultry association members and imposed a fine of PKR 50 million on PPA for contravention of Section 4 of the Competition Act. In 2021, the show cause proceedings against the said poultry association members also resumed after the Honourable Islamabad High Court had set aside the stay order(s) granted after a period of over 10 years.

CCP also concluded two enquiries in 2021 concerning possible collusive and anti-competitive practices in various market categories in the poultry sector including the market for broiler meat, eggs, day old broiler chicks and various poultry feed segments. The first enquiry report revealed that inter alia the poultry feed mills collectively fixed the price of poultry feed and, in the other enquiry, it was concluded that inter alia the hatcheries/poultry companies collectively discussed and decided on prices of day-old broiler chicks, which are in provisions of Competition Law as well as other material prima facie violation of Section 4 of the Competition Act,

Daily Spokesman

31, December, 2022 | Page 06 - Online | CCP Press Release

SC decides first ever cartel case; Upholds finding of cartelization in poultry sector

Staff Reporter

ISLAMABAD: While deciding the first ever cartel case, the Honourable Supreme Court of Pakistan has decided the civil appeal filed on behalf of Pakistan Poultry Association (PPA) against the judgement of the Competition Appellate Tribunal, that upheld the Order of CCP dated 29 February 2016 with respect to price fixing in contravention of Section 4 of the Competition Act, 2010.

CCP had imposed a fine of PKR 100 Million on the Pakistan Poultry Association (PPA) for price fixing of poultry products, in violation of Section 4 of the Competition Act, 2010.

Honourable Supreme Court, to this extent, has allowed PPA's appeal and reduced the penalty from PKR 100 million imposed by CCP in its Order to PKR 25 Million, taking into account that the said advertisements by PPA were discontinued after a few days, i.e., "after two days for eggs and five days for poultry". The Honourable Supreme Court has directed PPA to pay the penalty amount of PKR 25 million within a period of 15 days from the date of the Order.

Moreover, the Supreme Court has directed CCP to "frame and notify relevant rules inter alia relating to

Currently, there exists guidelines on imposition of financial penalties. Under Section 57 of the Act, the Commission, with the approval of the Federal Government, has the power to make rules.

The Supreme Court proceedings pertained to CCP's Order wherein CCP found that PPA had inter alia discussed and approved the advertisement of prices of certain poultry products (concerning broiler chicken and chicken eggs) in the national press, which was prohibited under the Competition Act. Against CCP's Order, the first appeal was filed by PPA before the Competition Tribunal and its decision was authored by the Member, Technical, Mr. Ahmed Owais Pirzada. The Competition Tribunal held that: "...By advertising prices of the poultry products in the national press the appellant has clearly prevented, restricted and reduced competition within the relevant market, which is a clear violation of section 4 of the Act."

It was further observed that the findings recorded by CCP were "based on proper appraisal of relevant provisions of Competition Law as well as other material brought on record.

The same are, therefore, maintained." PPA had filed an appeal against the said Competition Tribunal order imposition of penalties" before the Supreme Court.

The Friday Times

31, December, 2022 | Online | CCP Press Release

Supreme Court Upholds Competition Commission Findings Against Poultry 'Cartel'

News Desk by News Desk

The Supreme Court of Pakistan upheld the findings of Competition Commission of Pakistan (CCP) against the Pakistan Poultry Association (PPA) in the first-ever cartel case in the country's judicial history. However, the apex court reduced the penalty amount imposed on the PPA from Rs. 100 million to Rs. 25 million.

In a statement issued yesterday, the CCP said that in deciding the country's first-ever cartel case, the Supreme Court of Pakistan gave a verdict on the civil appeal filed on behalf of the Pakistan Poultry Association (PPA) against the judgment of the Competition Appellate Tribunal, which upheld the CCP's 29 February 2016 judgment with respect to price fixing in contravention of Section 4 of the Competition Act, 2010.

The CCP had imposed a fine of Rs. 100 million on the Pakistan Poultry Association (PPA) for the fixing of price of poultry products, in violation of Section 4 of the Competition Act, 2010. The Supreme Court, to this extent, allowed the PPA's appeal and reduced the penalty from Rs. 100 million, imposed by the CCP in its order, to Rs. 25 million. The SC took into account that PPA advertisements were discontinued after a few days, such as "after two days for eggs and five days for poultry."

The Supreme Court directed the PPA to pay the penalty amount of Rs. 25 million within a period of 15 days from the date of the order. Moreover, it directed the CCP to "frame and notify relevant rules inter alia relating to the imposition of penalties."

Currently, guidelines exist on the imposition of financial penalties. Under Section 57 of the Act, the Commission, with the approval of the federal government, has the power to make additional rules to streamline its functions.

 $\frac{https://www.thefridaytimes.com/2022/12/31/supreme-court-upholds-competition-commission-findings-against-poultry-cartel/$

Associated Press of Pakistan (APP)

31, December, 2022 | Online | CCP Press Release

Supreme Court orders first ever cartel case; upholds finding of cartelization in poultry sector

ISLAMABAD, Dec 30 (APP): While deciding the first ever cartel case, the Supreme Court of Pakistan has decided the civil appeal filed on behalf of Pakistan Poultry Association (PPA) against the judgment of the Competition Appellate Tribunal, that upheld the Order of CCP dated 29 February 2016 with respect to price fixing in contravention of Section 4 of the Competition Act, 2010.

CCP had imposed a fine of Rs 100 million on the PPA for price fixing of poultry products, in violation of Section 4 of the Competition Act, 2010.

The Supreme Court, to this extent, has allowed PPA's appeal and reduced the penalty from Rs 100 million imposed by CCP in its Order to Rs 25 Million, taking into account that the said advertisements by PPA were discontinued after a few days, i.e., "after two days for eggs and five days for poultry". The Supreme Court has directed PPA to pay the penalty amount of Rs 25 million within a period of 15 days from the date of the Order.

Moreover, the Supreme Court has directed CCP to "frame and notify relevant rules inter alia relating to imposition of penalties" Currently, there exists guidelines on imposition of financial penalties. Under Section 57 of the Act, the Commission, with the approval of the Federal Government, has the power to make rules.

The Supreme Court proceedings pertained to CCP's Order wherein CCP found that PPA had inter alia discussed and approved the advertisement of prices of certain poultry products (concerning broiler chicken and chicken eggs) in the national press, which was prohibited under the Competition Act. Against CCP's Order, the first appeal was filed by PPA before the Competition Tribunal and its decision was authored by the Member, Technical, Ahmed Owais Pirzada.

The Competition Tribunal held that: "By advertising prices of the poultry products in the national press the appellant has clearly prevented, restricted and reduced competition within the relevant market, which is a clear violation of section 4 of the Act." It was further observed that the findings recorded by CCP were "based on proper appraisal of relevant provisions of Competition Law as well as other material brought on record. The same are, therefore, maintained." PPA had filed an appeal against the said Competition Tribunal order before the Supreme Court.

CCP has time and again highlighted collusive/anti-competitive practices in the poultry sector. First in 2010 where CCP issued show cause notices against 25 poultry association members and imposed a fine of PKR 50 million on PPA for contravention of Section 4 of the Competition Act. In 2021, the show cause proceedings against the said poultry association members also resumed after the Honourable Islamabad High Court had set aside the stay order(s) granted after a period of over 10 years.

CCP also concluded two enquiries in 2021 concerning possible collusive and anti-competitive practices in various market categories in the poultry sector including the market for broiler meat, eggs, day old broiler chicks and various poultry feed segments. The first enquiry report revealed that inter alia the poultry feed mills collectively fixed the price of poultry feed and, in the other enquiry, it was concluded that inter alia the hatcheries/poultry companies collectively discussed and decided on prices of day-old broiler chicks, which are in prima facie violation of Section 4 of the Competition Act.

https://www.app.com.pk/business/supreme-court-orders-first-ever-cartel-case-upholds-finding-of-cartelization-in-poultry-sector/

Urdu Point

31, December, 2022 | Online | CCP Press Release

Supreme Court Orders First Ever Cartel Case; Upholds Finding Of Cartelization In Poultry Sector

APP - Associated Press Of Pakistan

ISLAMABAD, (APP - UrduPoint / Pakistan Point News - 30th Dec, 2022): While deciding the first ever cartel case, the Supreme Court of Pakistan has decided the civil appeal filed on behalf of Pakistan Poultry Association (PPA) against the judgment of the Competition Appellate Tribunal, that upheld the Order of CCP dated 29 February 2016 with respect to price fixing in contravention of Section 4 of the Competition Act, 2010.

CCP had imposed a fine of Rs 100 million on the PPA for price fixing of poultry products, in violation of Section 4 of the Competition Act, 2010.

The Supreme Court, to this extent, has allowed PPA's appeal and reduced the penalty from Rs 100 million imposed by CCP in its Order to Rs 25 Million, taking into account that the said advertisements by PPA were discontinued after a few days, i.e., "after two days for eggs and five days for poultry". The Supreme Court has directed PPA to pay the penalty amount of Rs 25 million within a period of 15 days from the date of the Order.

Moreover, the Supreme Court has directed CCP to "frame and notify relevant rules inter alia relating to imposition of penalties" Currently, there exists guidelines on imposition of financial penalties. Under Section 57 of the Act, the Commission, with the approval of the Federal Government, has the power to make rules.

The Supreme Court proceedings pertained to CCP's Order wherein CCP found that PPA had inter alia discussed and approved the advertisement of prices of certain poultry products (concerning broiler chicken and chicken eggs) in the national press, which was prohibited under the Competition Act. Against CCP's Order, the first appeal was filed by PPA before the Competition Tribunal and its decision was authored by the Member, Technical, Ahmed Owais Pirzada.

The Competition Tribunal held that: "By advertising prices of the poultry products in the national press the appellant has clearly prevented, restricted and reduced competition within the relevant market, which is a clear violation of section 4 of the Act." It was further observed that the findings recorded by CCP were "based on proper appraisal of relevant provisions of Competition Law as well as other material brought on record. The same are, therefore, maintained." PPA had filed an appeal against the said Competition Tribunal order before the Supreme Court.

CCP has time and again highlighted collusive/anti-competitive practices in the poultry sector. First in 2010 where CCP issued show cause notices against 25 poultry association members and imposed a fine of PKR 50 million on PPA for contravention of Section 4 of the Competition Act. In 2021, the show cause proceedings against the said poultry association members also resumed after the Honourable Islamabad High Court had set aside the stay order(s) granted after a period of over 10 years.

CCP also concluded two enquiries in 2021 concerning possible collusive and anti-competitive practices in various market categories in the poultry sector including the market for broiler meat, eggs, day old broiler chicks and various poultry feed segments. The first enquiry report revealed that inter alia the poultry feed mills collectively fixed the price of poultry feed and, in the other enquiry, it was concluded that inter alia the hatcheries/poultry companies collectively discussed and decided on prices of day-old broiler chicks, which are in prima facie violation of Section 4 of the Competition Act.

https://www.urdupoint.com/en/business/supreme-court-orders-first-ever-cartel-case-1618060.html

Daily Jang

31, December, 2022 | Back Page | CCP Press Release



اسلام آباد (این این آئی) سپریم کورٹ نے پہلی دفعہ کسی کار ٹیا تریش کیس کا فیصلہ کرتے ہوئے پاکستان پولٹری الیوی ایش (پی پی اے) کیخلاف مسابقتی کمیشن آف پاکستان کے فیصلے کو برقرار رکھا۔ پریم کورٹ نے پولٹری الیوی ایش کو پولٹری سیکٹر میں کارٹیلائزیشن پر پنڈرہ دن کے اندرڈ ھائی باتی صفے 7 نمبر 9

بقي سپريم كورث جرمانه ا

Daily Nawa-e-Waqt

31, December, 2022 | Front Page | CCP Press Release

كارشلائزيش پربولٹرى ايسوى ايشن كودھائى كروررويے جرمانہ

سیریم کورٹ نے رقم کم کردی مسابقتی کمشن کا فیصلہ برقر ازجر مانہ 15 روز کے اندر جرنے کا حکم

اسلام آباد (نمائندہ خصوص) سپریم کورٹ نے خلاف مسابقتی کمیشن آف پاکستان کے فیصلے کو پہلی وفعہ کسی کارٹیلائزیشن کیس کا فیصلہ کرتے ہوئے برقرار رکھا۔ سپریم کورٹ نے پولٹری ایسوی ایشن کو پاکستان پولٹری ایسوی ایشن (پی پی اے) کے پولٹری سیکٹر میں کارٹیلائزیشن صفحہ پر بقیہ نمبر 43

بقيه 43 كار ثيلائزيش

پر پھرہ دن کے اندر اندر ڈھائی کروڈ روپ
جرانے کی رقم ادا کرنے کے ادکانات بھی جاری
کردیئے۔ پریم کورٹ کی جانب سے کپنیشن
اپیلیٹ ٹریبول کے فیصلے کے فلاف دائرسول ایمل کا
فیصلہ کیا، جس نے مسابقتی کمیشن کے تھم 29 فروری
فیصلہ کیا، جس نے مسابقتی کمیشن کے تھم 20 فروری
کے سیکشن 4 کی خلاف ورزی کرتے ہوئے پرائس
فیسنگ کے حوالے سے تھا۔ می می پی نے کپنیشن
ایکٹ 2010 کے سیکشن 4 کی خلاف ورزی پر
فیلٹری مصنوعات کی پرائس فیسنگ پر پولٹری ایسوی
ایشن پر 2010 ملین روپ کا جرمانہ عا کرکیا تھا۔
میریم کورٹ نے صرف اس حد تک پی پی اے کی
ایمل منظور کی اور می کی کی طرف سے اپنے آرڈر
میں لگائے گئے جرمانے کو 100 ملین روپ ہے کہ
ایمل منظور کی اور می کی کی طرف سے اپنے آرڈر

Daily 92 News

31, December, 2022 | Front Page | CCP Press Release



سپریم کورٹ نے مسابقتی کمیشن کا 10 کروڑ روپے کا جرمانہ گھٹا دیا، جرمانے کی رقم 15 روز میں ادا کرنے کا فیصلہ سنادیا

ی می پی جر مانہ کے نفاذ کے قواعد بنائے: سپریم کورٹ، نہروں سے متعلق سندھ ہائیکورٹ کے فیصلے بیخلاف اپیل خارج

اسلام آباد، کرا چی (آن لائن، این این تھم برقرار رکھتے ہوئے جرمانے کی رقم 2 کروٹ خلاف ورزی کرتے ہوئے پولٹری مصنوعات کی آئی) سپریم کورٹ نے سابقتی کمیشن کی جانب 50 لاکھروپے 15 دنوں میں اداکرنے کا تھم دیا ہے پرائس بگسٹگ پر پاکستان پولٹری ایسوی ایشن (پی سے پاکستان پولٹری ایسوی ایشن پر عائد جرمانے کا سی پی نے کمپٹیشن ایکٹ 2010 کے کیشن 4 کی بی اے) پر 100 ملین (باتی صفحہ 5 نمبر 18)

ا کیتیبہ کی ایس کی کورٹ اور کے اور کے ایس کی کی ایس کی کی ایس کی کردیا، اس بات کو مد نظر رکھتے ہوئے کہ وہی گیا گئے کے جم کر استہارات کی کھورٹ کے ایس بات کو مد نظر رکھتے ہوئے کہ وہوں کے بعد بند کر دیے گئے تھے۔ سیریم کورٹ نے پولٹری سیکٹر میں کارٹیا کڑ بیش پر پی اے کھورٹ کے ایس کی کی ایس کی کھورٹ کے ایس کی کھورٹ کے ایس کی کھورٹ کے تھے۔ اس کی کھورٹ کے کھورٹ کی کارٹی کی کارٹی کی کی کھورٹ کے کھورٹ کی کارٹی کی کارٹی کی کارٹی کے کھورٹ کے کھورٹ کے کھورٹ کی کارٹی کی کارٹی کے کھورٹ کے کھورٹ کی کارٹی کے کھورٹ کے کھورٹ کے کھورٹ کی کارٹی کے کھورٹ کی کھورٹ کے کھورٹ کے کھورٹ کے کھورٹ کے کھورٹ کی کھورٹ کے کھورٹ

ون کے اندر 25 ملین رویے جرمانے کی رقم ادا كرے _ پريم كورف نے ى كى لى كو بدايت كى ب كهوه جرمانول كے نفاذ كے حوالے ہے متعلقہ قواعد وضع اورنو ٹیفائی کریں سیریم کورٹ کی کارروائی سی یی کے عم معاق تھی جس میں ی بی نے لی لی پ اے کو پکھر اولٹری مصنوعات برائلر چکن اور چکن کے انڈوں سے منتعاق کی تیمنوں پر ڈسکشن اور تو می پریس میں اشتہارات کی منظ**وری میں ملوث یا یا جو** کمپٹیے ا بكث كر تحت ممنوع تقى ى ى ي كر تقلم كے خلاف پہلی ایل بی بی اے نے کمپیشن ٹرامیوٹل کے سامنے دائر کی تھی اور اس کا فیصلہ مبر کینیکل احمداویس پیرزادہ نے تحریر کیا تھا۔ک۔ پی بی اے نے ی بی ٹریونل کے مذکورہ جھم کے خلاف سیریم کورٹ میں الیل دائر کاتھی۔ی ی نے پولٹری سکٹر میں کھ جوڑ اور کمپٹیشن مخالف سر گرمیوں کو بار باراجا کر کیا ہے۔ ی ی نی نے 2021 میں بولٹری سیفر میں مختلف مارکیٹ کیلیکر پر بشمول براعر گوشت، اندے، ڈے اولڈ برائلر چوزوں اور پولٹری فیڈ میں مکنہ کھ جوڑ اور کپٹیشن مخالف سرگرمیول کے متعلق دو انکوائزیاں بھی کمل کیں اور کہلی انکوائری رپورٹ میں انکشاف كيا كياك يولئرى فيذ الزنے بولٹرى فيڈكى قيتوں كا لغين اجماعي طور يركيا اور دوسرى انكوائرى ميس بينتيجه اخذكيا كياكم بولٹرى كمينيول نے اجماعى طور پر أے اولله براعكر چوزوں كى قيتوں پر تبادله خيال كيا۔ علاوہ ازیں سپریم کورٹ کراچی رجسٹری نے نارااور جمراو کدنال کی میچنگ اور مرمت کی مدیس نجی ممپنی کو 5 8 کروڑوں جاری کرنے سے متعلق سندھ ہائیکورٹ کے فیصلے تخلاف سندھ حکومت کی اپیل والى لينے يرخارج كردى-

Daily Dunya

31, December, 2022 | Front Page | CCP Press Release

سپریم کورٹ، بولٹری ایسوی ایشن کوڈھائی کروڑ جرمانہ کا تھم عدالت نے مسابقتی کمیشن کے جرمانے کو 100 سے کم کرکے 25 ملین کردیا پاکستان بولٹری ایسوی ایشن 15 دن کے اندر جرمانہ ادا کرے ، عدالت عظمی اسلام آباد (خبرنگارخصوص) پہلی دفعہ کی کارٹیلائزیشن | پاکستان بولٹری ایسوی ایشن کی جانب ہے کمی کمیشن کیس کا فیصلہ کرتے ہوئے سپریم کورٹ نے اپیلٹ ٹربیوئل کے فیصلے کے (باقی صفحہ 3 بقیہ 10)

بقیه نمبر 10 جرمانه حکم

خلاف دائرسول اپیل کا فیصله سنا دیا جس میں ہی تی کے 29فروری2016 کوجاری کردہ علم کو برقر اررکھا کیا جو کمپی نیش ایک ، 2010 کی سیکشن که کی خلاف ورزی کرتے ہوئے برائس فِکنگ کے حوالے ہے پاکستان پولٹری ایسوی ایش پرعا ئدجر مانے کا برقرار رکھتے ہوئے جرمانے کی رقم 2 کروڑ 50 الک روبدادا کرنے کا حکم دیا ہے۔سی کی نے کمی بیش ئے بولٹری مصنوعات کی برائس فِکسنگ بریاکستان پولٹری ایسوی ایش (یی تی اے) پر 100ملین رویه کا جرمانه عائد کیا تھا،اس حکم کے خلاف سیریم الت جرمانے كو 100 ملين رويے سے كم كرك 25

Daily Nai Baat

31, December, 2022 | Front Page | CCP Press Release



شی بات سیریم کورٹ 14

(پی پی اے) کے خلاف سابقی کمیشن آف
پاکستان کے فیلے کو برقرار رکھا۔ پریم کورٹ نے
پلٹری ایسوی ایش کو پولٹری سیکٹریس کارٹیلائزیشن پر
پندرہ دن کے اندر اندر ڈھائی کروڈ رویے جرمانے
مسابقتی کیشن آف پاکستان کے مطابق سپریم کورٹ
مسابقتی کیشن آف پاکستان کے مطابق سپریم کورٹ
کی جانب ہے کمپیٹیشن اپیلیٹ ٹریوٹل کے فیلے کے
خلاف دائر سول اپیل کا فیصلہ کیا، جس نے مسابقتی
کمیشن کے تھم 29 فروری 2016 کو برقرار رکھا جو
درزی کرتے ہوئے پرائس فِلنگ کے حوالے ہے
کمپیٹیشن ایکٹ، 2010 کے سیشن کم کی خلاف
فاری کی پی نے کمپیٹیشن ایکٹ 2010 کے سیشن
فورزی کرتے ہوئے پرائس فِلنگ کے حوالے ہے
کاجرمانہ عائد کیا تھا۔ پریم کورٹ نے صرف اس حد
فلر نے ہوئے کہ اپیل منظور کی اوری کی پی کی
طرف ہے اپنے آڈر میں لگائے گئے جرمانے کو
طرف سے اپنے آڈر میں لگائے گئے جرمانے کو
دیا ہے۔ سیریم کورٹ خوی می پی کو ہمائیت روپے کرمانے کو

کہ وہ جرمانوں کے نفاذ کے حوالے سے متعلقہ تواعد
وضع اور نو شفائی کریں ۔ بی بی بی نے پی بی اے کو
کچھ پولٹری مصنوعات (برائلر چکن اور چگن کے
انڈوں سے متعلق) کی قیمتوں پر ڈسکشن اور قوئی
برلیں میں اشتہارات کی منظوری میں ملوث پایا، جو
گہیٹیشن ایک کے تحت ممنوع تھی، جس پراسے
جرمانہ کیا گیا تھا۔ پی پی اے نے اس بھم کے خلاف
بیریم کورٹ میں اپیل دائر کی تھی۔

Daily Ausaf

31, December, 2022 | Back Page | CCP Press Release



جر ما نوں کے نفاذ کے حوالے سے متعلقہ قواعد وضع اور نو ٹیف ائی کریں ،ع

سے لگائے جرمانے کو 100ملین سے کم کر

اسلام آباد (مانیٹرنگ ڈیسک) سپریم کورٹ نے | خلاف مسابقتی کمیشن آف پاکستان کے فیصلے کو | اندراڑھائی کروڑ روپے جرمانے کی رقم اداک میلی وفعہ کی کارشاائزیش کیس کافیملہ کرتے ہوئے برقر اررکھا۔ بریم کورٹ نے پولٹری ایسوی ایشن کو کے احکامات بھی جاری کردیے۔ سابقتی کیش آف

یا کتان پولٹری ایسوی ایش (پی بی اے) کے اپولٹری سیکٹر میں کار شیائزیشن پر پندرہ دن کے اندر کیا کتان کے مطابق (باتی صفحہ 4بقیہ نمبر 22)

بقی کمیشن کے علم 29 فروری 2016 کو برقرارر کھا جو کمپیشن ایک، 2010 کے سیشن 4 کی خلاف ورزی کرتے ہوئے پرائس فِکسنگ کے حوالے سے تھاری می لی نے کمپیشن ایک 2010 کے سیشن 4 کی خلاف ورزی پر بولٹری یا اوری می فی کی طرف سے اینے آڈریس كن جرمائے كو 100 ملين رويے سے كم كر كے 25 ملين رو بے كرديا ہے۔ يريم كورث نے ى ی فی کوہدایت کی ہے کہوہ جرمانوں کے نفاذ کے حوالے ہے متعلقہ قو اعدوضع اور نو میفائی کریں۔

Daily Jehan Pakistan

31, December, 2022 | Back Page | CCP Press Release

سپریم کورٹ: بولٹری ایسوی ایش پرعا کد جرمانے کا حکم برقر ار عدالت عظی کا جرمانے کی قم2 کروڑ 50 لا کھ 15 دن بیں اداکرنے کا تھیم اسلام آباد (آن لائن) بریم کورٹ نے ایش پر عائد جرمانے کا تھم برقرار رکھتے ہوئے سابقتی کیشن کی جانب سے پاکستان پہلڑی ایسوی جرمانے کی رقم 2 کروڑ (باتی صفحہ 6 بقیہ نمبر 31)

كالمقى اوراس كا فيصله ممبر تيكنيكل احمداويس بيرزاده

Daily Metro Watch

31, December, 2022 | Page 03 | CCP Press Release

جرمانے کے فیصلے کیجلاف بولٹری ایسوی ایشن کی ای کے مستر و اولئری ایسوی ایشن کی ای کے مستر و اولئری ایسوی ایشن کی ایشن کو کار شیلائز بیشن پر ڈھائی کروڑ رویے جرمانے کا تھم اسلام آباد(آئیاین پی) پریم کورٹ آف پاکتان ایسوی ایشن کی ایپل مسترد کرتے ہوئے کیلی دفعہ کی خصابی کیشن کے جرمانے کے خطاف پولٹری کارٹیلائز بیشن کیس کا (باتی سفہ 5 بھیہ نمبر 38)

38

بیاجس میں ماکستان بولٹری ایسوی ایش کے خلاف سابقتی کمیشن آ ف ماکتان کے فصلے کو برقر ار رکھا مما میڈیا رپورٹس عے مطابق سیریم کورٹ نے بولٹری كاندراندر وهائي كروژرويے جرمانے كي رقم اداكرنے کے احکامات بھی جاری کروٹئے۔مسابقتی کیشن آف یا کتان کے مطابق سیریم کورٹ کی جانب ہے کمپٹیشن المیلیٹ ٹریول کے فیلے کے خلاف دائر سول ایل کا فیملہ کیا، جس نے سابقی کمیشن کے حکم 29 فروری 2016 کو برقرار رکھا جو کمپٹیشن ایکٹ، 2010 کے سيكن 4 كى خلاف ورزى كرتي موئ براس وكسنگ کے حوالے سے تھا۔ ی می نی نے کمپٹیشن ایک 2010 شن 4 کی خلاف ورزی پر پولٹری مصنوعات کی پراس فِکسنگ بر بولٹری ایسوی ایش پر 100 کمین رویے کا جرمانہ عامد کیا تھا۔ سیریم کورٹ نے صرف اس ولی نی اے کی ایک منظور کی اوری سی نی کی طرف ائے آ ڈرمیں لگائے گئے جرمانے کو 100 ملین رویے سے کم کر کے 25 ملین روئے کر دیاہے۔ سریم كے حوالے ہے متعلقہ تواعد وضع اور نو نیفائی ر مانہ کیا گیا تھا۔ ٹی لی اے نے اس تھم کے خلاف ورٹ میں ایک وائز کی تھی۔

Daily Pakistan

31, December, 2022 | Back Page | CCP Press Release

سپر یم کورف مسابقتی کمیشن جرمانے کے کینواف پولٹری ایسوی ایشن کی ایپل مستر د اسلام آباد (بیورور بورث) سپریم کورث آف پاکستان نے سابقتی کمیشن کے جرمانے کے ویشلے کیخلاف پولٹری ایسوی ایشن کی ایپل مستر د کرتے ہوئے کہا وقعہ کسی کارٹیلائزیشن کیس کا فیصلہ کراجس میں (یا تی سفیہ 5 بقیہ نمبر 27)

لمیشن آف باکتان کے فصلے کو برقرار رکھا گیا یر چدرہ ون کے اعد اعد و حالی کروڑ رویے جمانے کی فرادا کرنے کے احکامات بی حاری لرويخه مسابقتي كيشن آف باكتان كے مطابق ملے کے خلاف دائرسول ایل کا فیصلہ کیا،جس نے سابقتی کیش کے علم 29فرور کا 2016 کو برقرار رکھا جو کچیشن ایک ، 2010 کے پیشن 4 کی شلاف ورزی کرتے ہوئے مراس فلنگ کے حالے سے تھا۔ی ی فی نے کیٹیش ایک 2010 کے عیش 4 کی خلاف ورزی پر بولٹری مصنوعات کی برائس فکستک بر بولٹری ایسوی ایشن ير 100 ملين رويه كاجرمانه عائد كيا تفاسيريم کورٹ نے صرف اس حد تک کی لیا ہے کی ایل منظور کی اوری می کی طرف سے اے آڈریس لگائے گئے جرمائے کو 100 ملین روبے ہے کم کر ك 25 ملين روي كروباء يرع كورث نے ى ى لى كوبدايت كى سے كدوہ جرمانوں كے نفاذ ك حوالي سے متعلقہ قواعد وسع اور نوفیفائی كريس سى سى في نے في في اے كو بكھ بولٹرى معتوعات) برائلر چکن اور چکن کے انڈول ہے متعلق (کی قیمتوں پر وسکشن اور توی پریس میں اشتهارات كى منظوري مين ملوث يايا، جو كميثيثن ا یک کے تحت منوع تھی،جس براہے جریانہ کہا گیا تفالى لى الساية ال تملم كے خلاف سيريم كورث

Daily Islam

31, December, 2022 | Back Page | CCP Press Release

سپریم کورٹ میں پی پی اے کیخلاف میابقتی نمیشن کا فیصلہ برقرار

اسلام آباد (مانیٹرنگ ڈییک) سپریم کورٹ نے
کیلی دفعہ کسی کارٹیلائزیشن کیس کا فیصلہ کرتے ہوئے
پاکستان پولٹری ایسوی ایشن (پی پی اے) کے خلاف
مسابقتی کمیشن آف پاکستان کے فیصلے کو برقرار رکھا۔
سپریم کورٹ نے پولٹری ایسوی ایشن کو پولٹری سیکٹر میں
کارٹیلائزیشن پر پندرہ دن (باقی صفحہ 7 نمبر 3)

القينبر 444 (3

29 فرور 2016 كويرقرار ركا ا يك 2010 كيشن 4 كي خلاف ورزي بريولثري